

Gray Tuttle

Competing Nationalisms in East Asia: Representing Chinese and Tibetan Relations in History

Day/Time: Tuesday 4-6pm **Location:** TBA **Email:** gwt2102@columbia.edu
Office: 504 Kent **Office hours:** 1-2pm Tuesday and by appointment **Phone:** 854-4096

Nationalism has dramatically influenced the writing of history in East Asia. This seminar will first introduce theories of nationalism and their application to Asia in general, in a case study of conflicting Japanese and Chinese nationalist versions of history, and in China and Tibet in particular. The class will conclude with an examination of both Chinese and Tibetan nationalist representations of their shared history, as well as the perspectives that these two extreme ideologies serve to limit. Finally, students will turn these examples and analytical tools to the other contexts of their own choosing that they will explore through independent research.

By critically examining the historical arguments for and against the inclusion of Tibet as part of the modern Chinese nation-state, students will have an opportunity to compare two important cultural traditions presented as competing national entities. Together we will examine the issue of nationalist influences on representations of Asian history through the lens of Chinese and Tibetan historiography. This will serve as an analytical model for guiding students' research on their own chosen topic. Individually, students will examine nationalist historical writing in their own country of interest or in the conflicting representations of history between two of these countries. Students will be particularly encouraged to explore previous versions of history and current controversies about how the events of the Japanese occupation of Korea, Manchurian, Inner Mongolia or parts of China Proper (e.g. the events surrounding the fall of Nanjing) are remembered.

The main requirements for the course are regular participation (on-line and in class), classroom presentations & writing assignments. Students will rotate in their responsibility to respond to and grapple with the readings assigned. *With few exceptions, the readings are not terribly difficult, but your task is not easy: to read in a concentrated manner in order to extract significant points of analysis.* All students will post weekly on-line responses to the reading on courseworks. The initial research proposal and preliminary bibliography for students' chosen topics will be due in the first half of the course. A research proposal detailing the central question(s) the each student will be examining is due mid-semester. Final presentations of the students' conclusions (15-20 minutes depending on class size) will be scheduled for the last week of class. An independent research paper of 15-20 pages will be the culmination of the course.

| Evaluation based on: | Percentage of Final Grade |
|--|----------------------------------|
| Participation (on-line and in class) | 25% |
| Oral Presentations (rotate in class & final project) | 25% |
| Final Paper | 50% |

Required Books:

- 1) Benedict Anderson. *Imagined Communities*.
- 2) Geoff Eley & Ronald Suny, *Becoming National: A Reader*.
- 3) Courseworks articles and other readings, including:

Gray Tuttle

- a) W. D. Shakabpa. *Tibet: A Political History*. New York: Potala Publications. (reprint: <http://www.paljorpublications.com/> Paljor Publications, 2010)
- b) Wang Jiawei and Nyima Gyaincain. *The Historic Status of China's Tibet*.

General Expectations:

- As participation is such a key component of the class, attendance at all classes is expected.
- Your written work for the final paper should be entirely your own, with careful citation of all sources according to an accepted Manual of Style (Chicago, MLA).

PART I: Introducing Nationalism (In theory, in Asia, and in China)

Week 1 (1/19): **Introduction to the Class**

Week 2 (1/26): **What is a nation, nationalism? How do they effect history writing?**

Week 3 (2/2) **Introduction to Theories of Nationalism**

Week 4 (2/9) **Introduction to Nationalism in Asia**

Week 5 (2/16): **Nationalist Historiography between Japan and China: Nanjing**

Week 6 (2/23): **Introduction to Nationalist Historiography in China/Tibet**

Part II: Comparing Tibetan and Chinese Nationalist representations

Week 7 (3/2): **The Period of Rival Empires (Tang Dynasty)**

Week 8 (3/9): **Tibet and China under Mongol Domination (Yuan Dynasty)**

3/16 Spring Break

Week 9 (3/23): **Economy and Religion between China and Tibet (Ming Dynasty)**

Week 10 (3/30): **China and Tibet under Manchu Rule (Qing Dynasty)**

Week 11 (4/6): **Republican China and Independent Tibet**

Week 12 (4/13): **China and Tibet under Han Chinese Rule (PRC)**

Week 13 (4/20): **New Directions: “Chinese” Tibetans and Pro-Tibetan Chinese**

Part III: Competing Nationalisms in Context

Gray Tuttle

Week 14 (4/27): Student presentations

PART I: Introducing Nationalism (In theory, in Asia, and in China)

*

Week 1 (1/19): **Introduction to the Class**

Week 2 (1/26): **What is a nation, nationalism? How do they effect history writing?**

Etienne Balibar. "The Nation Form: History and Ideology," in Geoff Eley & Ronald Suny, *Becoming National: A Reader*. 133-149.

"Learning Each Other's Historical Narrative" a project of project of the Peace Research Institute in the Middle East (PRIME) <http://www.vispo.com/PRIME/leohn.htm> as a model (of two opposing perspectives).

John Powers. 2004. *History as Propaganda*. "Old Tibet: A clash of myths," 3-27.

Ernest Renan. 1882. "What is a nation?" in *Becoming National*, p. 42-54.

Week 3 (2/2) **Introduction to Theories of Nationalism**

What is a nation, nationalism? Old or new, invented or natural?

Benedict Anderson. Ch 1: "Introduction," Ch 2 "Cultural Roots," Ch 3: "The Origins of National Consciousness." *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism*. pp. 1-46.

Anthony Smith. "The Origins of Nations," in Geoff Eley & Ronald Suny, *Becoming National: A Reader*. 105-130.

Week 4 (2/9) **Introduction to Nationalism in Asia**

Are nations/nationalisms different in Asia?

What factors influenced the development of Asian nationalism?

Stein Tønnesson and Jan Antlöv. "Asia in Theories of Nationalism and National Identity." In *Asian forms of the nation*, pp. 1-40.

Michael Robinson. "Enduring Anxieties: Cultural Nationalism and Modern East Asia." In Harumi Befu, ed. *Cultural Nationalism in East Asia: Representation and Identity*. pp. 167-186.

Prasenjit Duara. "Historicizing National Identity, or Who Imagines What and When," in *Becoming National*, p. 150-177.

Week 5 (2/16): **Nationalist Historiography between Japan and China: Nanjing**

Chinese(-American) Nationalist View: Iris Chang, *Rape of Nanking*, 1997. Selections.

Gray Tuttle

Chinese Nationalist View: Shi Young, James Yin; foreword Desmond M. Tutu; preface Ying-shih Yu. *The rape of Nanking: an undeniable history in photographs*. 1997.

Japanese Nationalist View: Higashinakano Shudo ; translated by Sekai Shuppan. *The Nanking Massacre: fact versus fiction : a historian's quest for the truth*. 2005.

Scholarly View: Joshua Fogel. *The Nanjing Massacre in history and historiography*. 2000. [electronic resource]. [Click here for full text](#). Read at least the introduction, p. 1-11.

Optional:

Scholarly (?) view: New York Times, Sunday Book review of Iris Chang's *Rape of Nanking* by Orville Schell (Dean of Graduate School of Journalism at the University of California, Berkeley); http://www.irischang.net/press_article.cfm?n=6

Week 6 (2/23) Introduction to Nationalist Historiography in China/Tibet

What is distinctive about the nations/nationalism of China and Tibet?

What factors influenced the development of Chinese/Tibetan nationalism?

John Fitzgerald. "The nationless state: The search for a nation in modern Chinese nationalism." *The Australian Journal of Chinese Affairs* (33):75-104.

Georges Dreyfus. "Tibetan Religious Nationalism: Western Fantasy or Empowering Vision?" in *Tibet, Self and the Tibetan Diaspora*. P. 37-56.

Ashlid Kolas, "Tibetan Nationalism: The Politics of Religion," *Journal of Peace Research*, 33:1 (1996) 51-66.

Suggested Reading:

Georges Dreyfus. "Proto-Nationalism," in *Tibetan Studies*, Oslo, 1994, 205-218.

Kauko Laitinen. "Modern Discontent with the Whole Imperial System: The Birth of Early Chinese Nationalism." in *Chinese Nationalism in the late Qing Dynasty: Zhang Binglin as an Anti-Manchu Propagandist*. pp. 38-54.

Yeshe Choeden. "Issues of Tibetan Nationalism and National Identity." in *Tibet, Self and the Tibetan Diaspora*. P. 361-386.

Part II: Comparing Tibetan and Chinese Nationalist representations

>How can we analyze and understand these relatively new and developing social phenomena (nation/nationalism) through the lens of writing about (sometimes ancient) history?

>How is the present played out in the past?

>Visit: "Learning Each Other's Historical Narrative" a project of project of the Peace Research Institute in the Middle East (PRIME) <http://www.vispo.com/PRIME/leohn.htm>

Week 7 (3/2): The Period of Rival Empires (Tang Dynasty)

How to think about reading the writing of history: Michel-Rolph Trouillot, "The Three Faces of Sans Souci: Glory and Silences in the Haitian Revolution." in *Silencing the Past: Power and the Production of History*. Pp. 31-69.

Tibetan view: W. D. Shakabpa. Ch2 "The empire of the early kings of Tibet." *Tibet: A Political History*. pp. 23-53.

Chinese view: Wang and Nyima. Ch 1 "Relations between the Han and the Tibetans in the Tang and Song Dynasties." *The Historic Status of China's Tibet*.

Zhang Shixiong, Jiao Shuji, and Bai Yu. *The ancient Tangbo Road: Princess Wen Cheng's Route to Tibet*. 3-13.

Scholarly view: Christopher Beckwith. "The Tibetans in the Ordos and North China: Considerations on the Role of the Tibetan Empire in World History," 1-11.

Week 8 (3/9): Tibet and China under Mongol Domination (Yuan Dynasty)

To Think About: The Mongol Yuan dynasty was the first time that China took something like the territorial shape it has today (not exactly, as Korea and Tibet were similarly included and Mongolia of course was as well). But it is looked at as the first time there was this kind of multi-ethnic state that now exists in China. Consider the perspectives of the Chinese today and those likely for the Chinese of the time period (facing the infamous Mongol hordes). For the Tibetans, this period was also a mixed blessing. Though Tibet was reunified after centuries of division, it was by an outside power (a pattern that repeats itself into the present). Think about how the authors manage to present the best face on these issues while still reading this period through the lens of nationalism.

Tibetan view: W. D. Shakabpa. Ch4 "Lamas and Patrons." *Tibet: A Political History*. pp. 61-72.

Chinese view: Wang and Nyima. Ch 2 "Relations Between the Emperor of the Yuan Dynasty and the Prince of Dharma of the Sagya Sect of Tibetan Buddhism." *The Historic Status of China's Tibet*.

Rinchen trashi. "Tibetan Buddhism and the Yuan Royal Court." *Tibet Studies*. 1-26.

Scholarly view: Herbert Franke. 1983. "Tibetans in Yüan China." In *China among equals: the Middle Kingdom and its neighbors, 10th-14th centuries* pp. 296-328.

Gray Tuttle

3/16 Spring Break

Week 9 (3/23): Economy and Religion between China and Tibet (Ming Dynasty)

Tibetan view: W. D. Shakabpa. Ch5 “The Phamo Drupa, Rinpung, and Tsangpa Hegemonies.” *Tibet: A Political History*. pp. 73-90.

Chinese view: Wang and Nyima. Ch 3 “Ming Dynasty's Policy of Enfeoffment and Tribute-Related Trade.” *The Historic Status of China's Tibet*.

Du Changfeng. “The Tribute-Paying by Ü-Tsang to the Ming Court.” *Tibet Studies*, 2.2. 1990. pp. 84-96.

Scholarly view: Gray Tuttle. “Using Zhu Yuanzhang’s communications with Tibetans to justify PRC rule in Tibet.”

Week 10 (3/30): China and Tibet under Manchu Rule (Qing Dynasty)

For the readings this week, try to apply some of the ideas that we learned from Anderson and Smith, to test how they work in Chinese and Tibetan portrayals of history. Think especially about the ways they divided up the world prior to the arrival of nation-states. For Anderson, the dynastic (organized around a single family) and religious (organized around a sacred language) realms were key. For Smith, a lateral (connecting elites in different ethnies) and vertical (connecting different classes within a single ethnies) communities were key. What evidence of these communities do we see in these writings? And if there is a failure to articulate that vertical ethnies existed in either China or Tibet, what does this tell us about the way that contemporary writers of history manipulate the past to serve the present? Duara and Smith argue that some sense of ethnic community preceded the arrival of the nation-state; can you see evidence of this in the writings for this week?

Tibetan view: W. D. Shakabpa. Ch9 “Beginnings of Manchu Influence,” Ch10 “War with the Gurkhas and Dogras.” *Tibet: A Political History*. pp. 140-183.

Chinese view: Wang and Nyima. Ch 4 “The Sovereign-Subject Relationship Between the Qing Dynasty Emperor and the Dalai Lama.” *The Historic Status of China's Tibet*.

Yu Changan. “On the Policies of Administration for the Tibet Region formulated by the Central Government of the Qing Dynasty.” In *Theses on Tibetology in China (II)*. pp. 117-147. (see next entry as well...)

Scholarly view: Chen Qingying. “Lcang-skya Rolpavi-rdorje and Emperor Qian Long.” pp. 67-90.

Gray Tuttle

Week 11 (4/6): **Republican China and Independent Tibet**

Tibetan view: W. D. Shakabpa. Ch14: "Tibet's struggle to maintain her independence," Ch15: "Further evidence of Tibetan independence," Ch 16 "Clashes between Tibetans and Chinese in Kham." *Tibet: A Political History*. pp. 224-274.

Chinese view: Wang and Nyima. Ch 5-6 "British Invasion and the Birth of the Myth of "Tibetan Independence"" & "Tibet Is Not an Independent Political Entity During the Period of the Republic of China." *The Historic Status of China's Tibet*.

Yang Gongsu. "The Origin and Analysis of the Schemes of the so-called 'Independence for Tibet'." In *Theses on Tibetology in China (I)*. pp. 290-353.

Scholarly view: Gray Tuttle. "Saving Republican China through religious activity: Chinese reliance on Tibetan Buddhism." pp. 1-42.

Week 12 (4/13): **China and Tibet under Han Chinese Rule (PRC)**

Chinese view: Wang and Nyima. Ch7-8 "The Founding of the People's Republic of China and the Peaceful Liberation of Tibet." & "Armed Rebellion in Tibet Opposed the Democratic Reform Through Which Serfs Win Human Rights." *The Historic Status of China's Tibet*.

Dissident view: Song Liming. "Reflections on the Seventeen-point Agreement of 1951." *Tibet through Dissident Chinese Eyes: Essays on Self-Determination*. pp. 55-70.

Tibetan view: W. D. Shakabpa. Ch18: "The Chinese Communist Invasion," Ch19: "The Revolt," Ch 20 "Conclusion." *Tibet: A Political History*. pp. 299-325.

Scholarly views: Melvyn Goldstein. "On modern Tibetan history: Moving beyond stereotypes," in *Tibet and her neighbours, a history*. Pp. 217-226.

John Powers. 2004. *History as Propaganda*. "Family Reunion," 122-139.

Week 13 (4/20): **New Directions: "Chinese" Tibetans and Pro-Tibetan Chinese**

Heather Stoddard. "Tibetan Publications and National Identity." *Resistance and Reform in Tibet*. Robert Barnett and Shirin Akiner. pp. 121-156.

Wang Xiaoqiang. "The Dispute between the Tibetans and the Han." *Resistance and Reform in Tibet*. Robert Barnett and Shirin Akiner. pp. 290-295.

Cao Changching. "Brainwashing the Chinese," "Independence: The Tibetan People's Right." *Tibet through Dissident Chinese Eyes: Essays on Self-Determination*. pp. 3-31

See also, the newly released: *The Tibet Issue and China's Peaceful Development*
Published by [World Scientific Publishing Co Pte Ltd](http://www.worldscientific.com) Editor: **Huang, Jing**
ISBN: **978 981 283 595 6** Publication date: **30 April 2009**

Week 14 (4/27): **Student presentations**

Final Paper Due May 11